

**MARICOPA COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS MINUTE BOOK**

**SPECIAL SESSION  
August 5, 2004**

The Board of Supervisors of Maricopa County, Arizona convened in Special Session at 9:00 A.M., August 5, 2004, in the Board of Supervisors' Auditorium, 205 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, Arizona, with the following members present: Andrew Kunasek, Chairman, District 3; Fulton Brock, District 1, Max W. Wilson, District 4, and Mary Rose Wilcox, District 5, (entered late). Absent: Don Stapley, District 2. Also present: Fran McCarroll, Clerk of the Board, Monica Farine, Minutes Coordinator; Shirley Million, Administrative Coordinator, Sandi Wilson, Deputy County Administrator, and Paul Golab, Deputy County Attorney.

**FUNDING FOR WEST NILE VIRUS EFFORT**

Item: Per ARS §42-17106(b), approve the transfer and expenditure of \$2,108,000 from Appropriated Fund Balance (480) General Fund (Fund 100) General Contingency (4811) to a existing line item in Appropriated Fund Balance (480) General Fund (Fund 100) Other Programs (4812) entitled "West Nile Virus". Approval of this item will allow the Environmental Services Department and the Department of Public Health to continue expanding their aggressive ground-based mosquito control measures throughout Maricopa County. The expenditures will include additional chemicals needed to treat 4,410,000 acres with adulticide; additional larvicide chemicals for treating 6000 known mosquito breeding sites; 200 additional mosquito traps; supplies, trailers for mounting and hauling mosquito foggers and operating expenses for the expanded ground-based control efforts. The Environmental Services Department is instructed to keep cities and towns informed about County mosquito abatement efforts. (C88050088) (ADM2350-003)

Al Brown, Director of Maricopa County Environmental Services Department, provided a presentation of the West Nile Virus showing the vector control program goals are to: 1) prevent disease, disability, and death; 2) reduce mosquito population; and 3) use products with the least negative impact on humans and agriculture.

**~ Supervisor Wilcox entered the meeting ~**

West Nile Virus has been in the United States since 1999 and not much is known about it. Of the 246 cases statewide, 234 are in Maricopa County. One theory is drought-affected birds are susceptible and have higher counts of virus in their blood because they had no previous immunity in place. Virus may remain active in a bird a short time after death making transmission unlikely, but if a cat got a bird just fallen, it could develop a mild case of West Nile Virus. People were advised to handle the birds with caution i.e. gloves, plastic bags, hand washing, but Mr. Brown said the risk of catching West Nile Virus from handling a dead bird is nil. Aggressive mosquito management includes natural controls, education, larvaeciding, and low volume fogging. In 2004, 120,000 acres were treated compared with last year when only 60,000 acres were treated. Al Brown said they have received excellent support from the Board of Supervisors.

Normal effort would be 6 vector control officers, 6 trucks with sprayers acting on a three-day response time, while current effort is higher with the monies the Board of Supervisors approved, adding staff to continue with ground application. A volunteer workforce has been recruited to assist deploying traps, ground spraying apparatus and inspection of breeding sites. Kirk Dombrowski brought a mosquito trap for viewing. Fogging is done between 3 A.M. and 6 A.M. as ground thermals are gone and winds are lessened. Discussion ensued on placement of traps, county employee involvement and ways to distribute dry ice for the traps.

**SPECIAL SESSION  
August 5, 2004**

In the field, 200 traps provide information to draw targets of hot spots limiting the number of square miles to treat with adulticide. There may be areas with no mosquito problem today, but with rain or an abandoned pool, conditions can change rapidly. Traps are moved to locate hot spots for new evaluation daily by vector control staff with State consultation. During a conference call with Mayors in other cities, they expressed a strong commitment to assist and were to hold a meeting of all their public information officers to implement communication to their respective citizens.

The Flood Control District, the cities, public works, and the state have pledged support. Chairman Kunasek offered Dr. Keen and the medical examiner facility for assistance. Cathy Eden, the Director of the Department of Health Services said State lab results are important guidance tools, and they work hand-in-hand with Maricopa County to devise the best strategy for trapping and testing. Information is obtained by trapping mosquitoes, identifying densities and speciating them. Supervisor Wilcox requested daily updates as to how those results are kept and asked to be notified if results are coming back too slow. Mosquitoes are speciated from samples to identify vector populations and levels. Floodwater mosquitoes are not vectors. Mr. Ingertholl, of the State Board of Health, indicated their experts were speaking with County Environmental Services to determine how many the State can speciate and test.

Although there are 6,000 potential mosquito-breeding sites identified in Maricopa County, 200 volunteers are assigned to the task but they can only check 20-30 sites per week. Sites testing positive are compiled on a list, which is distributed to each city. Chairman Kunasek said while out yesterday, he saw three green pools in one block. Surprised to see that many, he said neighborhood organizations need to go out to identify these sites. Anyone can help including block watch groups, Boy Scout groups, civic organizations, law enforcement agencies, TV news media helicopters, meter readers, garbage truck drivers, city workers and realtors. The public has received public service announcements in English and Spanish, multiple information hotlines, brochures, door hangers, free mosquito-eating fish called gamboosia, and the Deet Foundation is coming to distribute their product free to seniors and assist with public education. Fry's will distribute posters and brochures. Basha's also has a "Neato Mosquito" program they developed for elementary school children. There is notification to chemically sensitive people if one believes they need notification of applications. First, they register and they will receive a call back. Organic farmers will be notified of applications occurring around their farms.

Typical studies have shown untreated areas posed a 10.5 times greater risk of infection from West Nile Virus than in treated areas. The State Health Department in consultation with health agencies provided an aerial application model, which relies most on the integrated mosquito management process in place. If the mosquito population explodes despite all the best efforts including prevention methods, using larvaecide, natural controls, eliminating standing water, monitoring rainfall, using additional mosquito traps to bring more data points to bear on decision making, and monitoring the human and animal West Nile Virus indicators with additional ground capability, then it would be time to return to the Board to discuss the possibility of doing aerial application as a last resort. In that event, Supervisor Wilson requested an outline of the plan in a format that could be made available to the public for their input. Supervisor Wilcox added that the testing must be done as expeditiously as possible.

The pesticide Sumithrin, considered safest, is preferred for adult mosquito control around the country but must be registered when used. Toxicity is less than common substances, degrades rapidly in sunlight, and lasts four hours. The application rate is a third of an ounce for ground-based application and a half-ounce per acre for aerial application. This represents a miniscule amount of active ingredient will be used over a wide area and is the same ingredient used in over the counter insect spray and lice shampoo. Part of the public message for fogging includes efforts to minimize exposure, by staying indoors when

**SPECIAL SESSION  
August 5, 2004**

application occurs, shutting windows, washing garden fruits and vegetables, and bringing toys and pets indoors. Supervisor Wilson requested added publicity and additional information to warn people how to avoid being bitten.

CDC Surveillance data regarding pesticide applications for mosquito control, showed, when administered properly, insecticides posed a low risk for acute temporary health affects. The Health Department will be doing surveillance of the community, and working with extra epidemiology staff to help evaluate all reports and complaints of illness associated with the fogging. Supervisor Brock inquired how Anvil (trade name) was chosen as the primary pesticide. He said a fact sheet for Sumithrin stated it is toxic to fish and is not recommended for application to areas where water is present. Mr. Brown replied that Sumithrin is safe for use in certain formulation under a certain application rate for waterways. There may be another form of Sumithrin that cannot be applied around waterways. Mr. Ingertholl indicated that experts concur with Maricopa County Environmental Services that Sumithrin is the safest product to use for mosquito control. He added that formulation used for this application is generally regarded as nontoxic to warm blooded life because it is so diluted. However, as with all chemicals, asthmatics and people with certain allergies should take extra precautions. Supervisor Brock continued to express concern about the use of this pesticide.

Dr. Weisbuch said the county is infected with an unusual disease. Normal biological methods are used yearly to drain swamps and in treatments. They have their own side effects. He said the department was in constant contact with the CDC. They discuss the safest products to use for the specific infestation. Their communications have included discussions on botanicals, herbicides, and synthetic chemicals. If conditions change and an aerial spraying is indicated, the department would come back to the Board of Supervisors for specific authority.

Al Brown responded to additional questions from Supervisor Brock regarding effects of various chemicals on other insects including bees. Mr. Brown explained that each chemical is evaluated and rated based on its known effects on people, plants, animals and insects.

Speaker Marlena Machol (opposed to the current spraying program) indicated the call numbers for information are recorded messages with no information on the pesticide being used. She indicated that the chemicals used could have some adverse side effects and stated that birds, bats and dragonflies can get rid of large numbers of mosquitoes. She advocated the use of more larvaecides and questioned if 2 reported deaths qualifies this event as an epidemic.

Penni Pitre (opposed to spraying) lives in district two and expressed concern over fogging and spraying in Maricopa County. Ms. Pitre relayed her own experience with a pesticide, which caused a severe reaction. She has had numerous long-lasting symptoms including muscle pain, tremors, headaches, and memory loss. She suggested the Board consult other experts including Dr. Rapp and her book, "Our Toxic World." This book not only covers numerous chemical compounds and related possible adverse reactions but also contains information about preparations and compounds that can be used to prevent mosquito bites.

Speaker Representative Mark Thompson affirmed support and said on a walk in the neighborhoods of his legislative District 17, (southern Scottsdale and Tempe), he concluded more aggressive environmental controls regarding standing water should be administered. He issued a letter to his School Board requesting suspended irrigation for the duration of the mosquito cycle.

**MARICOPA COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS MINUTE BOOK**

**SPECIAL SESSION  
August 5, 2004**

Mr. Paul Chairington, member of the Flood Control District Advisory Board and engineer with Salt River Project, the largest surface water purveyor in the valley, said SRP cut back allocations of water this year but added there was no need to curtail irrigation at this point. SRP purchased tens of thousands of mosquito eating fish arriving almost daily from Arkansas to be sent to the canal system.

Supervisor Wilson commented that one night he received 5 calls about golf courses irrigating, then mowing causing tire mark ruts that fill with water. These water-filled ruts do not dry, and golf course maintenance needs to address these issues now, as the ruts are only getting deeper. Supervisor Wilson said he would like them to cure that problem before the Board has to.

Catherine Walters (opposed to spraying) researched long-term effects of chemicals on the environment and humans. She is opposed to fogging efforts and Sumithrin aerial spraying.

Chairman Kunasek asked Mr. Brown to address the Anvil product's toxicity after time if it continues to linger. Mr. Brown stated the product degrades in ultraviolet light, but in storm drains or shady clay areas, it could last longer. He advised the complaint line is 602-506-6116; and fogging line is 602-372-3000. The website is [www.maricopagov.envsvc](http://www.maricopagov.envsvc) or one can call 602-506-0700. Al Macias, Director of Communication for Maricopa County, indicated there is a website [www.maricopa/wnv](http://www.maricopa/wnv) with links to other county sites and more information. The Supervisors requested that the information be available in Spanish also. Supervisor Wilcox asked about methods of distribution to people who don't have computers. Al Macias, Public Information Officer, said that public service announcements are made on television and door hangers have been distributed in high-risk neighborhoods.

Michelle Harrington of the Center for Biological Diversity commented that pesticides registered with EPA should not necessarily be considered safe. Pyrethroids have not had a comprehensive review by the EPA. There was no consultation with US Fish and Wildlife regarding effects on endangered or threatened wildlife. She is concerned about cumulative effect on humans, pets, and wildlife. For the spray to be effective in Phoenix, it requires cooler temperature with no winds from 3 to 6 a.m. in the morning for its application. She encouraged Maricopa County and SRP to enter into a safe-harbor agreement with Game & Fish to use the native topminnow rather than gamboosia.

Michelle Stewart of Tempe commented on her neighborhood as her street has three pregnant women and two with newborns. Many are out walking 4:30 to 7:00 a.m. She opposes this chemical application especially because of especially the long-term effects, but is in favor of the alternatives Supervisor Brock suggested.

Sandi Barr, of the Sierra Club, represents the Grand Canyon Chapter with 12 thousand members residing in Maricopa County. As a resident in Supervisor Wilcox's district, she was concerned about future aerial spraying, and fogging with this particular pesticide. The Sierra Club endorsed the Alliance for Informed Mosquito Management Platform, which she will email and wants more aggressive elimination of standing water. Brown grass is not an undue hardship if irrigation is limited.

Lucas Hathcock is opposed to spraying chemicals in the air and on the ground. He wondered if the spraying is related to his headaches. He said that money has been spent to clean the air, now money is spent pumping chemicals into our air.

Russell Olinsky, N.S. an Environmental Specialist, said he has a Master's Degree in Environmental Engineering. He said the public should not handle dead birds. It's important to identify the species and

**MARICOPA COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS MINUTE BOOK**

**SPECIAL SESSION  
August 5, 2004**

genus causing human infections, and he wanted aerial photos or satellite photos showing rooftops and stagnant pools. Some air conditioning systems have no water coming out. Pitch roofs can have problems. People with evaporative coolers must be sure water drains off the roof. He offered to supply related charts.

Chairman Kunasek inquired about mailing information. He added that a great deal of money had been spent for aerial photographs so it was thought that news stations with more overhead flights and police agencies could be effective in identifying some of these standing bodies of water.

Halina Szyposzynski (opposed to spraying) has lived in District 3 in Phoenix for 9 years. She heard of the fogging from a Channel 15 news report Friday. She surveyed several friends and neighbors and found many did not know the fogging was going on. She wants public education efforts to be stepped up, and has concerns about quality control if the work must be contracted out to private contractors and wants to know what measures will be implemented about credentialing the applicators. She asked when it will end or if it will have to be repeated yearly.

Supervisor Wilson said this disease is here and must be dealt with. If one is bitten by a mosquito and survives, spraying for them is unnecessary because of immunities. Last summer West Nile Virus did not get firmly established where it could cause human disease, and next year will probably bring a human vaccine, as there already is a horse vaccine.

Motion was made by Supervisor Wilcox and seconded by Supervisor Wilson Per ARS §42-17106(b), to approve the transfer and expenditure of \$2,108,000 from Appropriated Fund Balance (480) General Fund (Fund 100) General Contingency (4811) to an existing line item in Appropriated Fund Balance (480) General Fund (Fund 100) Other Programs (4812) entitled "West Nile Virus". Approval of this item will allow the Environmental Services Department and the Department of Public Health to continue expanding their aggressive ground-based mosquito control measures throughout Maricopa County. The expenditures will include additional chemicals needed to treat 4,410,000 acres with adulticide; additional larvaecide chemicals for treating 6000 known mosquito breeding sites; 200 additional mosquito traps; supplies, trailers for mounting and hauling mosquito foggers and operating expenses for the expanded ground-based control efforts. The Environmental Services Department is instructed to keep cities and towns informed about County mosquito abatement efforts. (C88050088).

**MEETING ADJOURNED**

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Andrew Kunasek, Chairman of the Board

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Fran McCarroll, Clerk of the Board